Anatomy of a Judicial Decision

- 1. Caption
- 2. Page numbering
- 3. Headnotes
- 4. Parties
- 5. Procedural History
- 6. Facts
- 7. Issue
- 8. Reasoning
- 9. Holding
- 10. Judgment
- 11. Separate Opinions



Anatomy of a Case **Caption**

- 1. Parties
- 2. Docket #
- 3. Court
- 4. Locator info (reporter, volume, page)
- 5. Date decided

Anatomy of a Case Page numbering

* 469 ** 54

Anatomy of a Case Headnotes & Other Editorial Material

- Headnotes = Summaries of points of law discussed in decision prepared by editor. Categorized so you can look up other cases with same headnote.
- 2. Other editorial material.
- These are not part of the judicial opinion. They are added by (fallible) editors, so should never be cited.

Anatomy of a Case **Parties**

• Parties = litigants' basic role in case

Anatomy of a Case Procedural History

Procedural history = Procedural events that take place after the lawsuit has been filed, most importantly:

- 1. Cause of action
- 2. Remedy sought
- 3. Judgment below
- 4. Procedural act claimed to be erroneous

Anatomy of a Case

Facts

Determinative facts = Essential to controversy because it will determine the court's decision.

Anatomy of a Case

Issue

Issue = Question Presented = Legal question court must answer to decide the case.

To be answerable, the question must include:

- 1. Choice of law
- 2. Specific enactment or common law provision involved.
- 3. Specific legal issue
- 4. Determinative facts of the case

Anatomy of a Case Holding

Holding

=The answer to the Issue.

The legal consequence given the specific set of determinative facts. E.g.:
"Where determinative facts A & B, the legal consequence is X."

Anatomy of a Case Reasoning

Reasoning = Court's reasons used in choosing a rule and reaching a decision by applying the rule to the facts.

- Rule
- Rule Proof
- Rule Application to Facts

Rule = General principle from statute or case law that can be applied to specific facts of pending case to make decision. Rule proof = Explanation of the rule and reasons given by the court for why this rule is the law in the jurisdiction.

Rule application = Application of the rule to the facts of the case.

Anatomy of a Case

- 1. Judgment = court's procedural order.
- 2. Most common appellate court judgments:
 - Affirm = Don't disturb judgment below.
 - Vacate = Annul order determined to be improper.
 - Reverse = Direct entry of judgment for other party.
 (Sometimes, reverse is synonymous with vacate).
 - Remand = Return case to lower ct for further proceedings—may accompany vacate or revere.

Anatomy of a Case Separate Opinion

- Dissent = judge disagrees with judgment (result).
- 2. Concurrence = judge agrees with judgment but for different reasons.